



**Re: endangerment**  
Alan Carlin to: Al McGartland  
Cc: John Davidson

03/12/2009 04:08 PM

Agreed.  
Alan

Al McGartland

~~In light of the tight schedule and the turn of events, please do not have any dire...~~

03/12/2009 02:40:31 PM

From: Al McGartland/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Alan Carlin/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Davidson/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Chris Dockins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Steve Newbold/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 03/12/2009 02:40 PM  
Subject: endangerment

In light of the tight schedule and the turn of events, please do not have any direct communication with anyone outside of NCEE on endangerment. There should be no meetings, emails, written statements, phone calls etc. All communication needs to go through Steve and me and then to Paul, and then to OAR.

Al McGartland, PhD.  
Director, National Center for Environmental Economics  
US EPA  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20460

202.566.2244

**Fw: Comments on the Endangerment TSD**  
Alan Carlin to: Steve Newbold  
Cc: Al McGartland, John Davidson, Chris Dockins

03/16/2009 03:55 PM

Steve,

I have not heard from Al as of now so presumably the decision is yours as we approach the COB deadline today.

Since Friday I have endeavored to respond to your concerns about the extent of the material in my comments that have not so far appeared in the peer-reviewed scientific literature and about the title page in the hope that you will change your decision as to forwarding my comments to Paul and



then hopefully onto OAR. I am attaching a revised copy *Endangement comments v7b.doc* with some improvements in the list of references and the title page changes you requested. I have not had time to improve the formatting, however. I would like to note, however, that by my rough count roughly two-thirds of my references are to peer-reviewed publications. It is also my view that the critical attribute of good science is its correspondence to observable data rather than where it appears in the technical literature. I believe my comments are valid, significant, and contain references to significant new research since the cut-off for IPCC and CCSP inputs. They are significant because they present information critical to the justification (or lack thereof) for the proposed endangerment finding. They are valid because they explain much of the observational data that have been collected which cannot be explained by the IPCC models.

There is still time to submit my comments to Paul and I urge you to do so.

Alan

— Forwarded by Alan Carlin/DC/USEPA/US on 03/16/2009 03:04 PM —

From: Alan Carlin/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Steve Newbold/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: John Davidson/DC/USFPA/IS@FPA  
Date: 03/13/2009 10:49 AM  
Subject: Re: Fw: Comments on the Endangerment TSD

Hi Steve,

The authorship is clearly indicated on the last page. Actually, much of the non-observational material (ie, statements that do not involve direct interpretation of existing data) is actually in peer-reviewed literature somewhere and I have tried to reference everything. If it is not going anywhere, I will postpone changing the cover, although this is easily done.


Alan

Steve Newbold

Alan, At the moment I am working on combining John's and my comments into...

03/13/2009 10:28:46 AM



**Re: endangerment comments???**   
Al McGartland to: Alan Carlin  
Cc: John Davidson, Steve Newbold

03/17/2009 08:12 AM

---

Alan, I decided not to forward your comments. The time for such discussion of fundamental issues has passed for this round. The administrator and the administration has decided to move forward on endangerment, and your comments do not help the legal or policy case for this decision. I have stressed in previous emails that this is not a criteria document for climate change and greenhouse gases. If such a document is ever drafted, then perhaps your comments might be considered.

I can only see one impact of your comments given where we are in the process, and that would be a very negative impact on our office.

Al McGartland, PhD.  
Director, National Center for Environmental Economics  
US EPA  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20460

202.566.2244



climate change work  
Al McGartland to: Alan Carlin

History: This message has been forwarded.

03/17/2009 08:20 AM

With the endangerment finding nearly final, you need to move on to other issues and subjects. I don't want you to spend any additional EPA time on climate change. No papers, no research etc, at least until we see what EPA is going to do with Climate.

I would like you to work with Marrietta to get that grants data base in place. I am not sure what the problem is there. Maybe its further along than I realize.

Also, I'd like you to update part of the market incentives report – inventorying the market incentive programs undertaken by the states (updating part of the market incentives report).

Let me know if you have even more time for other endeavors.

You may have heard that our budget was cut by 66%. This work will have to be done inhouse.

Al McGartland, PhD.  
Director, National Center for Environmental Economics  
US EPA  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20460

202.566.2244